

GRAPH B

FINANCIAL CONFLICT TIMELINE: Bankruptcy → Collins Hire → Arbitration

KEY ISSUE: The undisclosed financial and professional relationship between Anne Ashby and Michael Collins creates a direct appearance of bias tied to financial dependency and career reliance.

FINANCIAL CONFLICT TIMELINE

DATE	EVENT	SIGNIFICANCE
1985–1986	Ashby meets Collins at Smith Underwood	Start of long-term relationship
1986	Collins handles Ashby's divorce	Personal attorney-client relationship
1987–2009	Parallel careers (Judge / Attorney)	Ongoing professional alignment
April 2009	Ashby leaves bench + files Chapter 7 bankruptcy	Financial distress (~\$700K debt)
April 2009	Collins hires Ashby at his firm	Financial rescue / dependency
2009–2011	Ashby works as Director at Collins firm	Professional + financial tie
2011–2022	Continued overlap in legal community	Longstanding relationship continues
Sept 30, 2022	Ashby signs oath denying conflicts	No disclosure of financial ties
Oct 19, 2022	Appointed arbitrator	Conflict undisclosed at appointment
June 15, 2023	Partial disclosure	Still omits financial dependency

FINANCIAL CONFLICT ANALYSIS

FACTOR	IMPACT
Bankruptcy	Creates financial vulnerability
Collins hiring Ashby	Creates financial reliance
Undisclosed income issues	Raises credibility concerns
Long-term relationship	Creates loyalty bias
Failure to disclose	Prevents informed consent

CONCLUSION: The financial timeline demonstrates a clear pathway from financial distress to employment dependency on Michael Collins, which was never fully disclosed and creates a compelling appearance of evident partiality.